

## Planning and Highways Committee

### Minutes of the meeting held on 22 September 2016

**Present:** Councillor Ellison (Chair).

**Councillors:** Ahmed Ali, Nasrin Ali, Shaukat Ali, Barrett, Chohan, Curley, Loughman, Fender, Madeleine Monaghan, Paul and Watson. (Councillor Kamal attended from item 9)

**Apologies:** Councillors: Councillor Siddiqi.

**Also present:** Councillors: Manco.

#### **PH/16/107 Minutes**

To approve the minutes of the meeting held on 25 August 2016 as a correct record.

#### **PH/16/108 263 Mauldeth Road, Burnage, Manchester, M19 1GF**

A planning application 112586/FH/2016/S2 for the erection of a part single part two storey side extension and two storey rear extension to form additional living accommodation following demolition of existing extension was received.

The application site is a 2-storey semi-detached dwelling house situated on the northern side of Mauldeth Road in the Burnage ward. The property is constructed of red brick under a clay tile roof. There are gardens at the front and rear with access along the side via a block paved driveway. There is an existing single storey extension at the rear of the property.

The surrounding area is residential.

The application, which has been revised since first submission, seeks the determination of the Local Planning Authority for a 2-storey side and rear extension. In detail, the application proposes 2-storeys at the side built to the common boundary with no261 to the west with a 1.5metre set back at first floor. The side extension would have a width of 2.4metres.

At the rear, the proposed extension would have a depth of 1.8metres and is off set from the boundary of no261 by 1.9m.

The application shows how parking and bins would be accommodated.

The applicant is a City Council employee, hence the application being referred to the Planning and Highways Committee.

#### **Decision**

To **approve** the application for the reasons and subject to the conditions contained in the report.

**PH/16/109 Burnage Social Club, Mauldeth Road, Burnage, Manchester, M19 1AB**

A planning application 111886/FO/2016 for the erection of detached building to form flood defence testing facility was received.

The Burnage Social Club is located to the east of the Kingsway and Mauldeth Road junction and occupies a site approximately 1.1 hectare in size. The site, which formerly operated as a cricket club, consists of a social club and a manager's accommodation building/bar which is currently the subject of a planning application (112391/JO/2016/S2) to vary the external appearance. The remainder of the site consists of the former cricket pitch, though a portion of it which runs along the eastern boundary of the site has been subject to a large amount of tipped rubbish. Access to the site is via two driveways off Mauldeth Road.

To the north and east of the site there are dwellinghouses (Burnside Drive and Brookthorpe Avenue) while to the south, on the opposite side of Mauldeth Road, there is a commercial parade and further dwellinghouses. To the west of the site there are a number of commercial properties which front Kingsway.

The applicants are proposing to erect a single storey building in the northeast corner of the site to form a testing facility for domestic flood defence technology. This will be a separate entity to the social club. The proposed building would be single storey and consist of brick and metal cladding walls topped with a cladding mono-pitched roof. It would be between 5.4m to 6.4m in height and have a floor area of 189m<sup>2</sup>. Internally the building would consist primarily of four rooms (a reservoir room, a "flooding" area, a viewing/meeting area and a pump room) along with W.C. and kitchen facilities.

The applicant was present and spoke in support of the proposals. The applicant said that the objections were unfair as they had been taken out of the context of the existing poor state of the land in question. In addition the applicant stated that the implied impact on local residents had been exaggerated, and that the proposals would in fact improve the derelict part of the site. The applicant told the Committee that they had investment and approval for the scheme from several regional and national agencies, and that the funds raised would be put to use to benefit the whole community.

The Committee appreciated that the applicant was proposing to develop a facility that would benefit the whole community, but expressed the opinion that this was not the right site for a development of this nature. With this in mind they resolved to refuse the application.

**Decision**

To **refuse** to grant the application for the reasons contained in the report.

**PH/16/110 124 Mauldeth Road, Manchester, M14 6SQ**

A planning application 113327/FO/2016 for the change of use from Sandwich Shop (A1) to Hot Food Takeaway (A5) involving the erection of extraction flue to rear of premises was received.

This application relates to a two storey mid parade commercial property with a self contained flat above. The property has a two storey outrigger at the rear and a single storey extension. There is a small rear yard with access to the alley. At the front of the property there is a large shop window and two entrances, one for the commercial unit and the other for the first floor flat.

The application site is located within Ladybarn local centre, a small centre of some 28 units based on Mauldeth Road at its junction with Rink Street. The application site is close to the junction of Mauldeth Road and Weld Road and is adjoined by an existing hot food take away. Weld Road is residential and there are residential properties across Weld Road and facing the site across Mauldeth Road. Mauldeth Road Primary School is located approximately 190 metres to the east of the site.

Ladybarn local centre comprised 28 units of which 15 are class A1 shops, 2, class A2 Financial and Professional Services, 3, class A3 cafes and restaurants, 0, class A4 Bars, 4, class A5 Hot food Take Aways, 1 Sui Generis use, 1, class D1 Non Residential Institution and 2 vacant units.

Permission is sought to change the use of the property from a sandwich shop class A1 to a hot food take away class A5. As part of the proposal a flue would be installed on the rear elevation of the outrigger. No other elevational alterations are proposed, however the submitted drawings show four tables provided within the premises. The proposed opening hours are 7.00am to 6.00pm seven days a week. Refuse would be stored in the rear yard.

Ladybarn is a small local centre into which food and drink uses are starting to make inroads and as indicated earlier in this report a small increase in numbers has a significant impact in terms of the percentage of food and drink uses. On balance it is considered that the cumulative impact of a further hot food take away would harm the range of goods and services on offer and consequently the viability and vitality of the centre.

On balance it is considered that the proposed development would conflict with Core Strategy Policies SP1, DM1 and C10 and the emerging Draft Supplementary Planning Document on Hot Food Take Aways.

**Decision**

To **refuse** to grant the application for the reasons contained in the report.

**PH/16/111 New Victoria, Land At Corporation Street, Manchester, M3 1NX**

A planning application 111777/FO/2016/C1 for the erection of two residential buildings of a maximum 21 and 26 storeys to accommodate 520 apartments (176 x

1 bed, 286 x 2 bed and 56 x 3 bed apartments) (Use Class C3). Erection of one office building of maximum eight storeys comprising up to 11,647 sq. m (GIA) of office accommodation. Ground floor commercial space (Use Class A1, A2, A3 and B1), lower ground level car parking, access and servicing arrangements, alterations to Corporation Street, new public realm and other associated works was received.

New Victoria is located on the northern edge of Manchester city centre. It lies next to Manchester Victoria Station and the NOMA project, one of the City Council's key regeneration areas. The application site is 1.14 hectares and includes part of Corporation Street and Long Millgate. The majority of the site is used, or has been used, as surface level car parking.

To the east is Corporation Street and the Grade II listed former Co-op buildings which are being renovated. South of the site are four Metrolink tramlines and City Buildings, beyond this are the National Football Museum and the Arndale Centre. To the west is Manchester Victoria Station, one of the three main railway stations in Manchester. Cheetham Hill Road bridge is to the north, along with the former Parker's Hotel.

The site is heavily constrained by the River Irk culvert, which flows under the site from northeast to southwest, the proximity of the Victoria Station roof and train tracks with associated 'no build zones' and a restrictive height covenant.

New Victoria lies next to the Cathedral and the Shudehill Conservation Areas. There are no listed buildings within the red line boundary, but there are several around the application site. These include Parker's Hotel, 109 Corporation Street (Grade II), New Century House (Grade II), the Old Bank Building (Grade II), Hanover Building (Grade II) City Buildings, 67 Corporation Street (Grade II) and Manchester Victoria Station (Grade II).

The proposed scheme consists of three buildings along Corporation Street.

- Building 1 is a 26 storey residential building with 293 apartments (a mix of 1, 2 and 3 bedrooms). It is located to in the north part of the site and would be accessed from Corporation Street over a new footbridge. It would have a ground floor of resident amenity space (gym, residents' lounge, cinema room and toilets).
- Building 2 is a 21 storey residential building with 227 apartments (a mix of 1, 2 and 3 bedrooms). It is located in the central part of the site and has two ground floor units facing onto Corporation Street for A1, A2 and A3 uses. Also on the ground floor are a resident's lounge, cinema room and toilets.
- Building 3 is an eight storey office building. It is 11,647 sq. m. (125,367 sq. ft.) in size (gross internal area) and located in the south part of the site. The main entrance would be on the corner of Corporation Street and Halliwell Street. A ground floor unit is proposed for either A1, A2, A3 or B1 uses.

The 520 apartments are made up of 176 1 bed units (34%), 286 2 bed units (55%) and 56 3 bed units (11%) and are designed to comply with the Councils Interim

Space Standards. The apartments would be for the private rented sector (PRS) and a Management Company would be established with responsibility for the long term stewardship of all shared and public areas of the proposed scheme.

The applicant spoke in support of the proposals, and told the Committee that this was a high quality development in a prominent location within the City Centre. The applicant stated that the development would contribute to the regeneration of the surrounding area by being a major contribution to economic growth aligned to one of Manchester's key target growth areas (business services) identified in the Greater Manchester Strategy, as well as a significant catalyst for the wider regeneration of this area of the city centre, complementing investment in Victoria Station, NOMA, Green Quarter, Strangeways and New Cross. In addition, the proposals would fully use a vacant site by providing a high quality gateway into the city centre and would contribute to the regeneration of Corporation Street and the surrounding area.

Members raised issues in relation to waste disposal, the lack of affordable housing and cycle parking provision. .

### **Decision**

To **approve** the application for the reasons and subject to the conditions contained in the report.

### **PH/16/112 John Rylands Library, 148-58 Deansgate, Manchester, M3 3EH**

A planning application 109650/FO/2015/C1 for works to instate 10no. in-situ concrete pavement lights to the Wood Street elevation of John Ryland's Library alongside instatement of associated 6no. cast iron bollards and 1no. cast iron post and panel railing to provide protection from vehicular traffic was received.

John Rylands Library is a Grade I listed building, forming part of the University of Manchester Library Service. To the south is Spinningfields and Wood Street, a narrow one way street connecting Deansgate with Bridge Street is to the north. The site lies within the Deansgate Conservation Area.

The proposal involves the re-instatement of 10 pavement lights to the Wood Street elevation, the insertion of 6 cast iron bollards on Wood Street and the insertion of 1 cast iron post and panel rail on Wood Street.

The pavement lights on the Wood Street are currently infilled with mass concrete, which was poorly installed. It is not waterproof and over the past years has leaked continuously into the basement below.

This is a serious source of concern as the basement contains the 1920's book-stacks, which are noted as being highly significant within the Conservation Management Plan and these are filled with the JRL collections, which are themselves highly significant and susceptible to changes in humidity. The leaks are putting both the fabric of the grade I listed building and the collections it contains in danger of irreversible damage. Temporary works have been undertaken to seal the perimeter of the pavement apertures and it is now proposed to replace them with new in-situ

concrete pavement lights. The new concrete pavement lights would address the leaks and restore natural light levels as they once were.

A major cause of the current problem is from vehicles mounting the pavement and driving over the pavement lights. This causes the perimeter seals of the infills to fail and leak. Wood Street is a key servicing route within the area and traffic level have therefore increased. The pavement has fully collapsed this year, as has a manhole towards the rear of the pavement.

It is proposed to install 6 bollards along Wood Street to prevent traffic mounting the pavement and driving over the pavement lights. The bollards would be located such to ensure that full access would be available down the whole of the Wood Street pavement. The bollards would be low level and black cast iron which would respect the sensitive context in a functional manner.

A member expressed a concern that the installation of the bollards would affect safe access to the Wood Street Mission but was assured that access had been carefully considered and that conditions to mitigate risk have been included in the conditions contained in the report.

### **Decision**

To **approve** the application for the reasons and subject to the conditions contained in the report.

### **PH/16/113 38 Charles Street, Manchester, M1 7DB**

A planning application 111954/FO/2016/C1 for the change of use from former auctioneers (Sui Generis) to a mixed use entertainment venue comprising live music/event, bar and restaurant space (Sui Generis), with external alterations, including provision of a roof terrace and roof top extension was received.

The application site comprises a vacant 3 storey brick building that was previously used as an auction. It is bounded by a car park and a raised railway line, Pritchard Street, Charles Street and Donald Street. The site also includes a small area of hardstanding used for car parking and bin storage on the opposite side of Pritchard Street.

The building has a large decorated pediment to the front elevation which bears the original date and an overhanging cornice. The rear section of the building, next to the railway line, is a later addition.

The site is located in a mixed use area consisting of residential, office, hotels and leisure facilities including bars and clubs. The former BBC site is located on the opposite side of Charles Street.

The site neighbours the Grade II listed Lass O'Gowrie on Charles Street and is adjacent to the Whitworth Street Conservation Area.

Planning permission is sought to create a mixed use entertainment venue comprising live music/event, bar and restaurant space (Sui generis) along with external alterations. The aim is to create a hybrid café, bar and street food space, along with live music and community events.

The basement would include a small event space with seating around the perimeters and a small stage and bar.

The site is situated on the north side of Charles Street within a vibrant mixed use area comprising residential, office, hotels and leisure uses. The building has been vacant for circa 9 months and the proposed development seeks to transform it into a modern hybrid of café, bar and street food space, with a capacity to host live music and community events.

The approach for developing the application site is entirely supported by the provisions of the National Planning Policy Framework. It clearly provides a sustainable development, as defined by the NPPF, and the benefits in bringing forward this major development opportunity justifies approval of this scheme.

## **Decision**

To **approve** the application for the reasons and subject to the conditions contained in the report and the late representations.

### **PH/16/114 Former Manchester Metropolitan University Aytoun Campus, Aytoun Street, Manchester, M1 3GH**

A planning application 112034/FO/2016/C2 for the creation of approximately 478 residential units (160 x 1 bed and 318 x 2 bed) and commercial space comprising , (a) Conversion and extension of existing 12 storey building to 15 storeys (The Tower) comprising residential accommodation (Class C3 123 units) above ground and first floor (Class A1 (shop), A2 (Financial and Professional Services), A3 (Restaurant and Cafe), A4 (Drinking Establishment), B1 (Offices), D1(Non-residential Institutions crèche, nursery, clinic and health centre, art gallery only) and D2 (Assembly and Leisure - Gymnasium, indoor sport and recreation only), (b) Erection of 2 x 14-16 storey buildings (Blocks C and F comprising residential accommodation (Class C3 - 136 units (C) and 209 units (F)) above ground and first floor (Class A1 (shop), A2 (Financial and Professional Services), A3 (Restaurant and Cafe), A4 (Drinking Establishment), B1 (Offices), D1(Non-residential Institutions crèche, nursery, clinic and health centre, art gallery only) and D2 (Assembly and Leisure - Gymnasium, indoor sport and recreation only), Building F and Tower to be linked by podium; and, (c) change of use of existing 1 storey building on stilts (The Bungalow) to (Class A1 (shop), A2 (Financial and Professional Services), A3 (Restaurant and Cafe), A4 (Drinking Establishment), B1 (Offices), D1(Non-residential Institutions crèche, nursery, clinic and health centre, art gallery only) and D2 (Assembly and Leisure - Gymnasium, indoor sport and recreation only), and hard and soft landscaping comprising central public square, commercial and retail terraces, private residents terrace and public/ private roof top gardens with car parking for 69 vehicles located at ground and first floor levels and associated works to facilitate servicing and access following demolition to existing teaching and library buildings was received.

MMU has rationalised its Estate in Manchester as part of its 2020 Vision and has created a central campus at All Saints and Birley Fields bringing together functions from Didsbury, Hollings, Aytoun St and Elizabeth Gaskell. The Aytoun Street Campus was vacated in 2015 and the Applicants were selected as the successful bidders for the site in March 2014.

A Strategic Regeneration Framework (SRF) was endorsed by the Executive Committee on 3 June 2015 to ensure that the redevelopment of the site comes forward in a form which: delivers a high quality development; creates a new sustainable neighbourhood with a distinctive sense of place; and, is functionally and physically connected to the wider area. The SRF is a material consideration in the determination of this planning application.

The SRF boundary also includes two further areas of land that are not included within the current application site. These comprise the two Grade II Listed Buildings (Minto and Turner and Minshull House) and the adjacent Euro Car Park site. Proposals for the reuse of the two listed buildings are being prepared and will be the subject of applications later this year for apartments and commercial floorspace. The Euro Car Park site is not within the applicant's ownership.

Consent is sought for the demolition of the existing teaching and library buildings for the development of 478 residential units (160 x 1 bed and 318 x 2 bed) and commercial space comprising:

- (a) Conversion and extension of the existing 12 storey building to 15 storeys to form 123 flats (Class C3) the 'Tower' with ground and first floor A1/ A2/ A3/ A4/ B1/D1 and D2 uses;
- (b) The erection of two 14-16 storey residential buildings, comprising 136 units in block C and 209 units in block F, with ground and first floor A1/ A2/ A3/ A4/ B1/D1 and D2 uses; and
- (c) Change of use of the 1 storey building on stilts adjacent to Canal to A1/ A2/ A3/ A4/ B1/D1 and D2 uses.

The proposed buildings would be located around a landscaped public square which would front onto the Rochdale Canal. The proposals also include:

- commercial and retail terraces;
- private residents terrace and public/ private roof top gardens; and
- car parking for 69 vehicles and 478 (approx 6 spaces for every 10 bedrooms within the development) cycle parking spaces located at ground and first floor levels and accessed from Chorlton Street.

The Committee welcomed the very high proportion of cycle parking provision at the site, and while a Member was disappointed that another major development would not provide affordable housing provision was satisfied with the high quality and innovative design of the proposals.



## Decision

To **approve** the application for the reasons and subject to the conditions contained in the report.

### **PH/16/115 Former Manchester Regiment Public House, Hulme Hall Road, Castlefield, Manchester, M15 4LY**

A planning application 111424/FO/2016/C1 for the redevelopment of the site to provide a total of 42no. residential units comprising 1 and 2 bedroom apartments and associated parking was received.

The site measures some 540m<sup>2</sup> and has been vacant since its previous use as the Regiment public house ceased in March 2001.

The site is located at the corner of Hulme Hall Road and Ellesmere Street within the wider Castlefield area. On the opposite side of Ellesmere St are former mill buildings which have been converted to mixed use schemes, including residential. To the east, is commercial property, beyond which are further vacant sites. To the south is a surface car park accessible from Hulme Hall Road. To the west is Hulme Hall Road, opposite which are commercial properties and a site which has planning permission for a residential development. The area contains commercial properties, residential dwellings and some retail units. A number of planning applications have been approved in this area over the past 18 months as the economy has improved.

Deansgate train station is less than 1km from the site, and Cornbrook Metrolink station is less than 500m. The site is served by a number of nearby bus routes.

Planning permission was granted for a residential-led mixed use development (ref: 068900/FO/2003/C3) in April 2006, but was never developed and site as now expired.

There is a recognised need to accelerate the provision of new housing given the critical relationship between housing and employment growth and the importance of a vibrant construction sector. As such, the creation of new housing is a key objective for the City Council.

The application seeks permission for the erection of an 8 storey building to accommodate 42 apartments.

The proposed building would contain 8 one bedroom units, 32 two bedroom units and 2 penthouse units. The building would occupy the majority of the land available, with the main entrance located on Hulme Hall Road. The ground floor would provide four apartments and a lobby. Bike storage and bin storage are accessed from the rear of the building via the lobby. Four car parking spaces would be provided in an undercroft to the rear, enclosed with garage doors, accessed off Ellesmere Street. The building would have key active frontages to Hulme Hall Road and Ellesmere Street, providing natural surveillance. 42 cycle parking spaces would be provided, with 38 spaces within the bike store, and one space within each ground floor apartment as part of the development.

The built form would be broken down into two identifiable masses, the lowest of these is located on the corner of Hulme Hall Road and along Ellesmere Street and the massing of the building steps up from Ellesmere Street to Chester Road. The height of the building is directly comparable to the previously approved scheme. Façades would comprise grey brick construction punctuated by deeply recessed window.

It is considered that a residential development is acceptable, in principle, on this important City Centre site, and would be an appropriate response to national and local planning policy.

Given the above, it is considered that the proposal is in accordance with the City of Manchester's planning policies and regeneration priorities, including the Adopted Core Strategy, the relevant Strategic Regeneration Frameworks and the Community Strategy, as well as the national planning policies contained within the National Planning Policy Framework and should be approved.

### **Decision**

To **approve** the application for the reasons and subject to the conditions contained in the report.

#### **PH/16/116 Land Bounded By Old Mill Street, Weybridge Road, Coppersmith Road & New Islington Marina, Ancoats, Manchester, M4 6FD**

A planning application 112658/FO/2016/N1 for the erection of a part 10, part 4 storey building to form 201 residential apartments with associated car parking, hard and soft landscaping, vehicular access from Old Mill Street and other associated works was received.

The application site is approximately 0.6 hectares and is located within the New Islington area of Manchester which is one of the City's key regeneration areas. The site is bounded by Old Mill Street to the south, Weybridge Road to the east, New Islington Marina to the west and Coppersmith Road to the North.

The topography of the site is uneven and currently split into two sections separated by an informal pedestrian through route linking Old Mill Street with Coppersmith Road. Both parcels of land are currently overgrown with vegetation and shrubs and there is hardstanding on the site from former uses. There is currently an electrical substation of the north eastern parcel of land which is anticipated to be removed and relocated should planning permission be granted. There is currently not vehicular or pedestrian access to the application site with the parcels of land secured by weldmesh fencing.

The surrounding area is a mixture of uses reflecting the edge of the City Centre location and the application sites location within the Ancoats and New Islington regeneration area. The area is currently in the process of transition with a series of new of developments in progress together with early examples of the regeneration initiatives.

To the north of the application site along Coppersmith Road and Weybridge Road which contains a range of two and three storey residential properties which are a mixture of new properties and older stock. To the west of the site is the New Islington Marina which is a purpose built marina area where a number of moorings can be obtained. To the south of the site is the Grade II listed Ancoats Dispensary which is a former Victorian hospital currently surrounded and supported by scaffolding.

Old Mill Street has been subject to change and renewal over the past 10 years with new public realm and tree planting. Also located along Old Mill Street is the New Islington medical centre. Beyond the Ancoats Dispensary are the Chips building, Milners and Islington Wharf providing high, dense City Centre living along with Stubbs Mill which is currently being converted into office accommodation.

New Islington Free School has recently been completed and is now open along Redhill Street which will provide a new primary school for the area.

The site is well located to public transport with the New Islington tram stop being located some 300 metres from the application site. In addition, the site is within walking distance of the heart of the City Centre where there is access to a range of public transport nodes, shop, services, amenities and leisure activities.

The application is seeking planning permission for the erection of a part 10, part 4 storey building to form 201 residential apartments with associated car parking, hard and soft landscaping, vehicular access from Old Mill Street and other associated works.

An objector spoke to the Committee and said that he did not believe the proposal was acceptable for several reasons.

- The development of 10 storeys is out of context with all the surrounding buildings on Old Mill Street which are much lower in scale;
- The development is against several policies in the The Manchester Core Strategy (2012); and the Saved policies of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester (1995)
- There is insufficient car parking (including disabled parking) which in turn would put pressure on the surrounding streets;
- The development will reduce the light to the existing properties along Weybridge and Coppersmith Road and block the sun to the Marina area;
- The development will block light to the Chips building;
- There will be a loss of privacy from overlooking to the nearby residential properties;
- The elevations do not provide an interesting appearance;
- There will be dust and debris from the construction of this development on surrounding developments

The objector supported the concerns raised by Manchester Conservation Areas and Historic Buildings Panel who had expressed disappointment in the design and felt that the height, scale, elevational treatment and materials are all of concern. The objector also said that the height of the development would adversely affect the

amenity offered by views of the listed Ancoats Dispensary, which he said should be the dominant building in the area.

Officers confirmed to the Committee that the applicant has given careful consideration to the design, scale and layout of the development. The proposal would also meet the City Councils space standards.

Officers also confirmed that the proposal has been designed to respect the setting of the adjacent Listed Buildings along with maintaining established views around the application site and road network

## **Decision**

To **approve** the application for the reasons and subject to the conditions contained in the report.

*(Councillor Curley declared a personal interest in this item of business and took no part in the decision)*

### **PH/16/117 FC United Of Manchester, Broadhurst Park, 310 Lightbowne Road, Manchester, M40 0FJ**

A planning application 113376/JO/2016 for the Variation of condition 8 relating to planning permission referenced 096289/FO/2011/N1 to allow for changes to the organisation of match day fixtures was received.

In 2012, planning permission was granted for the redevelopment of the former Ronald Johnson playing fields, a 5.2ha area of open space within Broadhurst Park, for a new 5000 capacity sport stadium and associated community pitches (ref. 096289/FO/2011/N1). The stadium, community pitches and associated infrastructure are currently being constructed.

The Lightbowne Road site is bounded by a mature hedge and trees to the North West which runs parallel with Lightbowne Road. To the east and south of the site is the main stadium and ancillary pitches. The land adjacent to the edge of the car park is bounded by 335 St Mary's Road to the south and the main stadium, car parking and ancillary pitches to the north and west.

Broadhurst Park is located within a predominately residential area with two storey residential properties being located along St Mary' Road along with flats at Sydney Jones Court. To the north of Broadhurst Park is St Mary's C of E Primary School. To the west of the site, on the opposite side of Lightbowne Road, is Broadhurst Park playing fields.

The applicant is seeking to vary planning condition 8 of planning approval 096289/FO/2011/N1. This condition states:

*The development hereby approved shall not be used for FC United football matches or other large scale events on the same date or time as Manchester City FC home matches or other large scale events at the Sportcity complex. A written strategy for*

*the coordination between FC United and the Sportcity Manager over arrangements during match days to avoid clashes with events at Sportcity shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority prior to the first operation of the development. The development shall then be operated in accordance with these approved.*

*Reason - In order to minimise the peak demand within the area and to ensure the availability of remote car parks within the area, pursuant to Policies H2.2, E1.1, T2.4 and T2.6 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester.*

The variation of the planning condition is required in the event that matches have to be replayed at short notice, cup matches and TV requirements. The change in the condition is not expected to result in a frequent clashes between the two football clubs, particularly given league fixtures are set well in advance meaning that clashes can be avoided.

The applicant spoke to the Committee and explained the reasons for the application. The applicant has been operating from the application site for a full football season and, as a result, believes that condition 8 places unnecessary restrictions of the football club and its ability to offer its football programme.

In line with the applicant's aspirations and vision for the football club, the preference is that all league home games are played at the 'traditional' time of 3pm on Saturday afternoons. The provision of condition 8, however, precludes the applicant from playing a home game if Manchester City Football Club (MCFC) are also due to play at home on the same day even if the two matches are played at different times. Indeed, should there be any 'large scale event' at the Etihad campus; the applicant would not be able to play its home fixtures on the same day.

In light of there having been a full football season played at the application site, the applicant now believes there is sufficient evidence and data to assess the impacts of the operations of the football club on the local area and therefore believes that there is now a case to introduce a degree of flexibility within condition 8 in order that the football club can provide football in line with its vision and to manage any unexpected clashes that are announced within short notice.

On the basis of the application, officers confirmed that the planning condition, in its current form, is not appropriate. However, it is acknowledged that there is a level of concern amongst local residents about both football clubs playing on the same day/time. As such, it is not considered that the condition should be removed in its entirety and that some form of control/management needs to be employed when the two football clubs play at the same time/date.

In altering the condition, it is considered that in the first instance, the applicant should always seek to avoid FC United 1<sup>st</sup> team or other fixtures or events at the application site where the anticipated crowd is over 2,900 when there is a known match or large scale event at the Etihad stadium.

As league fixtures are announced prior to the start of the football season, it is considered that the applicant has the opportunity to work with the Football Association (FA) to avoid clashes associated with league fixtures. The approach of

avoiding clashes should ensure that the likelihood of clashes occurring within a football season remains low and infrequent. However, there will clearly be some instances where a clash cannot be avoided particularly, for instance, where a cup match has to be re-scheduled at short notice.

However, in light of the comments received from TfGM, it is considered that it is necessary to undertake further survey work which provides further evidence of the impact on the local highway network once the two football clubs have the opportunity to play at the same time. This will then influence what, if any, mitigation is required. It is therefore recommended that the following additional condition is required:

*For the first evening and first weekend match when Manchester City Football Club (MCFC) and FC United of Manchester when kick off is at approximately the same time (within one hour) of each other, a traffic condition impact survey shall be undertaken on the following routes to determine the impact on network traffic conditions.*

- *Lightbowne Road from Greenside Way to Thorpe Road (including Greengate Roundabout);*
- *Oldham Road (A62) between Droylsden Road and Queens Road.*

*The traffic condition impact surveys (including an assessment of the impact on traffic flows as well as traffic delays in terms of journey times) for each clash shall be submitted to the City Council, as Local Planning Authority, within one month of the match (and prior to any further clash taking place).*

*If there is any associated impact on traffic flows as a result of an evening or weekend clash in the opinion of the City Council, as Local Planning Authority, within one month of a written request, a scheme for the mitigation of the impact of traffic flows shall be submitted for approval in writing by the City Council, as Local Planning Authority and once approved, such mitigation measures shall be implemented and thereafter maintained.*

*Reason – To minimise the impact on traffic flows on the surrounding highway network when MCFC and FC United play at the same time/day pursuant to policies SP1, T2 and DM1 of the Manchester Core Strategy (2012).*

It is also recommended that condition 8 be altered to state that best endeavours should also be employed to avoid the clash. However, where there are instances where a clash cannot be avoided it is considered necessary to ensure that an appropriate strategy is put in place to minimise any potential impacts. As such, if it is clear that a clash cannot be avoided, a written strategy shall be submitted wherever possible within 48 hours of the clash occurring to confirm that best endeavours have been employed to avoid the clash and that any necessary coordination with Greater Manchester Police and traffic management can be employed.

It is therefore recommended that the condition is altered as follows:

*Best endeavours shall be used to avoid FC United 1st team or other fixtures or events at Broadhurst Park with an anticipated crowd of over 2,900 on the same day as Manchester City Football Club home matches (or any other large scale event) at the Etihad Stadium. Whenever possible within 48 hours of a clash occurring, a written strategy for the coordination between FC United and Manchester City Football Club shall be submitted to the City Council, as Local Planning Authority.*

*For the avoidance of doubt this strategy shall include:*

- Written evidence to demonstrate how best endeavours have been undertaken.*
- Where deemed necessary, reasonable additional traffic management, car parking and marshalling (or any other highway management related matters) shall be put in place*
- Evidence of coordination with the police.*

*The approved scheme shall be implemented for the match.*

All the other planning conditions have been updated to reflect the current position including that the Travel Plan and events management conditions will be refreshed in accordance with the previous guidelines.

## **Decision**

To be minded to **approve** the application subject to a deed of variation to the existing S106 agreement and for the reasons and subject to the conditions contained in the report.

### **PH/16/118 Corner Of Old Mill Street, Upper Kirby Street & Lampwick Lane, Bradford, Manchester, M4 6BX**

A planning application 111605/FO/2016/N2 for the erection of a 6 storey building to form 24 no. residential apartments (Use Class C3), together with access, landscaping, car parking, boundary treatment and associated works was received.

This application was considered by the Planning & Highways Committee on the 25 August 2016 and was deferred following concerns being raised in connection with the following:

- Affordable Housing
- Residential Space Standards
- Car Parking Provision

The application relates to a key development site within the Ancoats and New Islington regeneration area with a main road frontage onto Old Mill Street. The site has been vacant for some time and it is very important for the continuing regeneration of this neighbourhood for the site to be redeveloped with a high quality development, in terms of design, materials, space standards and amenity space. However, the delivery of such a development in this location must be financially viable. The applicant has provided a viability appraisal for the development, which has been fully assessed by the City Council. This demonstrates that the development is viable in its current form and is capable of being delivered. The report also confirms that the inclusion of affordable housing in this development would affect the viability of the scheme and the high quality proposals currently proposed could not be delivered. The scheme would therefore be unviable.

As outlined within the original report, the proposal for the YO! Home development is for all of the units to be made available on the open market for owner occupier

purchase or private rental. This product is aimed at those wanting and choosing a particular type of living and further would meet an existing housing need in this part of the City, particularly as there is already an adequate supply of socially rented accommodation in this location.

The housing need in this area is for high quality privately owned or rented accommodation for amongst others, young professionals and young families. This unique and innovative type of accommodation would diversify the housing offer within this area of the City and is fully supported by the principles embedded in the Ancoats and New Islington Regeneration Framework. This states that creating neighbourhoods of choice is essential if the City is to meet its pressing housing need and have the ability to retain as well as attract the range of talent that will fuel its next wave of economic growth and enhance productivity. In doing so the Framework recognises that the area has a major role to play in responding to the specific needs of a growing population and changing demographics, which means there is an increasing demand for a mixed portfolio of both owner occupation and rented housing that allows for new lifetime choices. Priority will therefore be given within Ancoats and New Islington to new development that changes and shapes its character by diversifying the tenure of housing type and promoting higher value development.

This together with developing an under used site which no longer contributes to the vitality and viability of the area would deliver significant regeneration benefits. The proposal is therefore considered to be in full accordance with the policy framework and officers do not believe that a refusal on the basis of affordable housing could be sustained.

Members requested further clarification over the scheme's accordance with the City Council's new Residential Quality Guidance and the internal space requirements.

As outlined within the original report, the draft "Manchester Residential Quality Guidance" document seeks to underpin the City Council's ambition to create sustainable and popular neighbourhoods where people want to live and, at the same time, to contribute to raising the quality of life in the city. The guidance is intended to encourage provision of enough space in dwellings to ensure homes can be flexibly used by a range of residents. It also aims to ensure that space can be sensibly allocated to different functions, with adequate room sizes and storage integrated into the planning. In assessing the space for a particular development, consideration needs to be given to the planning and laying out of the home and the manner in which its design creates distinct and adequate spaces for living, sleeping, kitchens, bathrooms and storage. The size of rooms should be sufficient to allow users adequate space to move around comfortably, anticipating and accommodating changing needs and circumstances.

This is a bespoke development which introduces an innovative design to the use of the proposed apartments. Each unit has a gross internal area of 40.8 sqm, which is larger than the 37 sqm figure suggested for a more traditional studio type apartment. The proposed apartments adopt an open plan layout with imaginative planning that reduces the need for circulation space such as hallways or corridors. This innovative and flexible layout provides a substantial living area when in day mode, providing



under floor voids for storage and imaginative space saving furniture. Each unit would have storage beyond the minimum recommended within the National Space Standards without compromising the floor space. When in night mode, the apartment then includes a substantial sleeping area which far exceeds the 11.5 sqm required under the National Space Standards. This use of multi-purpose furniture, cleverly crafted moving elements and a carefully considered design, results in the proposed development complying with the guidelines and principles outlined within the Manchester Residential Quality Guidance.

Additionally, the Ancoats and New Islington Regeneration Framework sets out the vision for a signatory new urban neighbourhood with architectural diversity. The new Residential Quality guidance complements both the Framework and the policy context within the Core Strategy focusing on the key principles to deliver quality development, which includes innovative and creative design. It advocates the use of new technology and new approaches which challenge norms and allows for new ways of living.

The proposal offers just such an approach which is compliant with the principles outlined within the Residential Quality guidance, the Core Strategy and the Ancoats and New Islington Regeneration Framework.

It is not considered therefore that a reason for refusal could be sustained in relation to residential space requirements.

The third area of concern raised by Members relates to the level of car parking proposed for this scheme due to problems being experienced within the wider area from commuter parking and parking related to the New Islington Free School.

This proposal seeks to provide 7 car parking spaces to the rear of the site with direct access off Upper Kirby Street. The applicant has confirmed that the spaces would be properly managed and would be monitored with regular patrols to ensure that only those who have the correct permission park here. This would ensure that the spaces are retained for use by the future residents of this development and not abused by commuter parkers.

The development as noted in the original report includes 100% cycle parking provision with the site also benefitting from strong public transport links. There are direct walking and cycling routes from the site and there is a bus stop almost directly outside the proposed building. Its high sustainable credentials include a link to the metro with the nearest tram stop 'New Islington' being only a short walk away (approximately 300metres). This is via a dedicated footway from the Ashton Canal towpath which connects with a footbridge at Ashton Canal lock 3. This tram service provides direct access to a number of very central locations, Manchester Piccadilly Train Station and beyond together with access to other forms of public transport. There is also a City Car Club base in front of the neighbouring Chips building, which is a pay as you go car hire service.

The parking equates to a 29% provision for the occupants of the development. However, this is a city centre location and due to the unique nature of the accommodation proposed in this development, it is expected that car ownership

would be low on the basis of this new flexible approach to City Centre living and would be part of a life style choice.

This accords with Policies T1 and T2 of the Core Strategy which seek to encourage modal shifts away from the car and locate new development that is accessible by walking, cycling and public transport.

Policy T2 of the Core Strategy states that developments in the City Centre should *'provide a level of car parking which reflects the highly accessible nature of the location, as well as the realistic requirements of the users of the development'*. This requirement to find a balanced approach to car parking provision for developments in highly sustainable locations, such as the application site, is also reflected within the Ancoats and New Islington Development Framework which states that:

*'New development proposal should be accompanied by an appropriate car parking strategy which allows the potential demand generated by future residents to be met whilst considering the promotion of alternative sustainable forms of transport. On site car parking solutions should be incorporated into development proposals in a manner that does not detract from the character or animation of the street'*

Based on the highly sustainable location and the unique nature of the proposed accommodation, it is considered that the right balance has been achieved between providing car parking for the occupants of the development together with taking advantage of and promoting the sustainability of the application site. With exceptional transport connections the travel plan would help to further reduce the reliance on car usage. The applicant has confirmed there is a comprehensive travel plan framework which seeks to promote alternative modes of travel. This includes providing residents with the appropriate information to inform their travel choices from the application site. An appropriately worded condition has been included in the suggested list of conditions in the original report.

Notwithstanding this, if future residents do have a car that cannot be stored at the application site, then there are numerous pay and display car parking in the local area. There a total of 134 pay and display car parks in Ancoats and outside of these areas are traffic regulation orders to prevent on-street parking. These parking restrictions would help to ensure that any additional parking demand from this development would not result in any negative effects on residential amenity in the local area.

Having regard to the above it is believed the development would have a minimal impact on the local highway network; there is some car parking and a 100% cycle provision, a travel plan and the site benefits from being in a highly sustainable location.

Whilst the concerns raised in relation to commuter parking and parking from the New Islington Free School are acknowledged, this is more localised in the area around Weybridge Road. It is not considered the proposal would in itself exacerbate parking issues and is in accordance with all relevant policy.

This report has set out to clarify and address the issues raised at the previous meeting. If Members wish to give additional weight to concerns about the proposed

car parking provision, they may wish to consider the following; however, the Committee is asked to consider this in the context of this supplementary report and the advice contained in it.

*The proposed development would generate a demand for car parking facilities, in a location with car parking pressures, which cannot be accommodated on this site in a satisfactory manner with the result that vehicles would be forced to park on surrounding highways to the detriment of residential amenity and the convenience of other users of the highway. As such the proposal is contrary to Policies SP1, T2 and DM1 of the Core Strategy.*

The Committee were satisfied that the additional report contained enough further information to alleviate the concerns that they had previously expressed.

### **Decision**

To **approve** the application for the reasons and subject to the conditions contained in the report.

### **PH/16/119 45 Upper Brook Street, Ardwick, Manchester, M13 9WS**

A planning application 111744/FO/2016/N2 for the erection of a four storey building to form motor trade dealership including workshop and car storage and erection of a single storey valeting building (Sui Generis) (10684 sqm) together with associated vehicular access from Kincardine Road and Inchley Road, car parking, landscaping, boundary treatment and other associated works following demolition of existing buildings was received.

The application site is the existing BMW dealership located at 45 Upper Brook Street. The site measures 0.74ha in area and is an irregular shape, which wraps around the Grade II\* listed Welsh Baptist Chapel that also fronts Upper Brook Street. The site faces the eastern side of Upper Brook Street which is one of the main arterial routes into Manchester City Centre from the south.

The site is also bounded to the north by Inchley Road, to the east by Kincardine Road and to the south by a Citroen car show room on Upper Brook Street. The application site is currently occupied by number of single storey buildings, including a car showroom and offices fronting Upper Brook Street, a car workshop and parts warehouse with access from Kincardine Road, and a used car showroom to the rear with access from both Kincardine Road and Inchley Road. There is also a vehicle wash bay located against the site's southern boundary onto Kincardine Road.

The existing car showroom buildings comprise mainly of full height glazing with pitched corrugated metal roofs. The car workshop and parts warehouse are constructed of red brick also with corrugated metal roofing. These buildings are then surrounded by surface level tarmac car parking both for the display of vehicles for sale and for customer parking. There is some existing soft landscaping around the boundaries of the site.

Upper Brook Street is a main radial route into and out of the City of Manchester and is characterised by both tall and lower level buildings. The eastern side of Upper Brook Street is mainly dominated in this immediate area by car showrooms and other businesses with the Brunswick residential neighbourhood and Gartside Gardens beyond it. The western side of the road is dominated by the Manchester Universities, the Hospital and the Oxford Road corridor beyond it.

There are a number of large buildings within this vicinity around the Upper Brook Street area, including the Aquatics Centre Car Park at 6 storeys high, the Alan Turing Building at 4 storeys high, the Manchester Materials Science Centre at 5 storeys high and the Schuster Building at 9 storeys high. To the rear of the site onto Kincardine Road is the student accommodation block at Kincardine Court, which is a part 5 storey part 6 storey building.

The Welsh Baptist Chapel that sits immediately adjacent to the application site is currently undergoing a significant redevelopment project to bring the former derelict Grade II\* listed building back into use as high quality residential accommodation. The application site also sits on the boundary with the Brunswick PFI area, which is also being transformed through new build housing and renovations to create a higher quality sustainable residential neighbourhood on the edge of the City Centre.

Planning permission is sought through this application for the redevelopment and expansion of the existing BMW car dealership at this site on Upper Brook Street, Kincardine Road and Inchley Road. To provide some background to the proposals, the submitted Design and Access Statement outlines that the existing facility is over 30 years old and is no longer fit for purpose. The existing facility was originally designed to sell 101 new cars and 75 used cars per year when BMW was a specialist car manufacturer. BMW has now become a premium volume car retailer and the existing facility cannot support the current demands. The site now sells 1,500 new cars and 1,000 used cars to private customers per year, as well as an additional 2,000 cars to corporate customers. As a result of its growth and success, and to enable the site to meet current business requirements, the redevelopment and expansion of this site is now essential if the business is to remain viable.

The development proposals include the demolition of all the existing buildings and other structures on the site. The application then seeks consent for the erection of a new 4 storey car dealership building including a car workshop and valeting area at the ground floor level, a car showroom, sales consultation areas, customer café and lounge area, offices, and staff facilities at the first floor level, with car storage on the second floor level. Further open car storage will be provided at roof level in addition to the plant room and lift overruns.

The new 4 storey building is proposed to be located in a similar position to the existing car showroom in the south west corner of the site and fronting Upper Brook Street, sited between the Welsh Baptist Chapel and the Citroen Dealership site. The footprint of the new building extends further towards the rear of the site where in the south east corner of the site there will be 3 vehicle wash bays, a plant room building and the main waste recycling area.

The land to the rear of the Welsh Baptist Chapel and to the corner of Kincardine Road and Inchley Road is to be demarcated for a customer parking area for 57 spaces including 4 disabled car parking spaces and a large secure bicycle storage area. The land on the corner of Inchley Road and Upper Brook Street would be demarcated for a staff parking area. The site is then bounded by a mixture of taller security fencing and lower level barriers with new landscaping and tree planting.

The proposal will see the redevelopment of a brownfield site where the buildings are currently of poor architectural quality, within the heart of one of Manchester's key regeneration areas. Careful consideration has been given to the siting, scale and appearance of the development to ensure it provide a high quality development along with minimising the impact on existing residents. Matters of car parking, cycle parking, highways, noise, ecology, flood risk and sustainability have all been considered along with ground conditions, designing out crime and waste management. The potential impacts on the adjacent Listed Building were fully set out within the report with the conclusion that the harm to the setting of the Listed Building would be less than substantial. It was further considered that the harm caused would be outweighed by the identified public benefits of the proposed development.

## **Decision**

To **approve** the application for the reasons and subject to the conditions contained in the report.

### **PH/16/120 Unit 2 Brookside Works, Clough Road, Manchester, M9 4FP**

A retrospective planning application 111421/FU/2016/N1 for the change of use of industrial unit (B1) to place of worship (D1) was received.

This application is being presented to the Planning and Highways Committee for members to agree what decision they would have made if the application was before them for determination. This is due to the applicant appealing against non determination of the planning application, and therefore the final decision now rests with the Planning Inspectorate.

This application is a re-submission following a refusal of the same proposal by the Planning and Highways Committee at its meeting of the 12th November 2015. The previous planning application is reference 109982/FU/2015/N1. The current application has now been submitted with the benefit of an acoustic report for consideration.

The application site consists of a single storey brick building, with a pitched corrugated tin roof. The building was previously in use for light industrial purposes as part of the Brookside Works Industrial Estate. Access to the premises is via double gates off Clough Road. The building has several access points that are covered by existing roller shutters. The unit fronts a small service road which is also informally used for vehicle parking.

The industrial estate consists of two main blocks which have been subdivided into a number of individual premises. The uses are mainly light industrial premises (Use

Class B2). Some of the units have direct access off Clough Road whilst others are serviced off the internal access road.

To the south west of the site is an area of grass land which was granted planning permission for 5 four bedroom houses in May 2012 (ref. 098789). Beyond this area are two storey residential terrace properties along Joule Street. To the north / north west of the site are further semi- detached properties along Carron Avenue and, to the south east of the site is further residential development along Clough Road. To the south of the site are further single storey buildings associated with the industrial estate. Clough Road bounds the site to the east, which, is characterised by two storey terraced and semi-detached properties. Clough Road is a minor residential road located off Moston Lane. Traffic calming measures are present along the road along with bollards to prevent parking on the pavement areas to the front of the residential properties at the junction of Carron Avenue and Clough Road near to the industrial estate.

This application seeks retrospective planning permission for the retention of a place of worship (Use Class D1) within Unit 2. Brookside Works, as the use continued following the earlier refusal of permission. An enforcement notice has been served and an appeal was subsequently submitted. That appeal has been withdrawn, however, as noted an appeal against non determination of this application has now been made. The Enforcement Notice remains in place. The applicant has requested to operate the following hours:

- Sundays 9:15 to 2:00pm
  - First Sunday monthly evening 6:00pm to 7:30 pm
- Tuesdays 6:45 pm to 8:45 pm
- Thursdays 6:00 pm to 8:00 pm
- Third Friday monthly 10:00 pm to 1:00 am
  - Last Friday monthly 7:00 pm to 9:00 pm
- Saturdays 2:00pm to 7:00 pm
  - Second Saturday monthly 8:30 am to 11:00 am
  - Last Saturday monthly 6:00 pm to 8:30 pm
- Wednesdays and Fridays 12:00 noon to 1:15 pm
  - 10:00 am to 6:00 pm.

The Committee considered all the representations when reaching their decision. The use of Unit 2 Whitehouse Works, as a place of worship (Use Class D1), creates harmful levels of noise, disturbance and comings and goings from the general activities associated with the use, such as vehicle movements and raised voices, along with noise outbreak from the premises (from singing, playing music and instruments). This has a detrimental impact on surrounding residential amenity particularly residents along Carron Street and Clough Road. This is contrary to the provisions of policies SP1 and DM1 of the Manchester Core Strategy (2012), saved policy DC26 of the Unitary Development Plan for the City of Manchester (1995) and the guidance contained within the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and the National Planning Policy Guidance (NPPG).

## **Decision**

Minded to **refuse** the application for the reasons set out in the report (A decision cannot be issued as an appeal against non-determination has been made)